

Blair	09/1144/CAC 09/1142/FUL	Personal Interest: As Chair of Governors at Orchard Park Community Primary School.
Walker	09/1144/CAC 09/1142/FUL	Personal Interest: As a Governor at St Matthew's School

4 Planning Applications

Change to Agenda order

Under paragraph 4.2.1 of the Council Procedure Rules, the Chair used his discretion to alter the order of business. However, for ease of the reader, these minutes will follow the order of the agenda.

4a 09/1144/CAC: Former St Colette's School site, Tenison Road

4a	09/1144/CAC
Site	Former St Colettes Preparatory School, George Pateman Court, Cambridge, CB1 2DP
Proposal	Demolition of all existing buildings.
Applicant	C/o 7 Dukes Court 54-62 Newmarket Road, Cambridge CB5 8DZ
Recommendation	GRANT CONSENT - Subject to conditions
Public Speakers	Mr Harter (objector) Lucy walker (Ward Councillor)
Decision	CONSENT GRANTED (by 6 votes to 2) with the following additional condition:

Except with the prior written agreement of the local planning authority, no demolition shall be carried out or plant operated other than between the following hours: 0800 hours to 1800 hours Monday to Friday, 0800 hours to 1300 hours on Saturday and at no time on Sundays, Bank or Public Holidays.

Reason: To protect the amenity of the adjoining properties. (Cambridge Local Plan 2006 policy 4/13)

4b 09/1142/FUL: Former St Colette's School site, Tenison Road

4b	09/1142/FUL
Site	Former St Colettes Preparatory School, George Pateman Court, Cambridge, CB1 2DP
Proposal	Erection of 12no 4 bed houses and 1no 5 bed house, internal access road and hard and soft landscaping following demolition of all existing buildings on site.
Applicant	C/o 7 Dukes Court 54-62 Newmarket Road, Cambridge CB5 8DZ
Recommendation	REFUSE
Public Speakers	Mr Harter (objector) Lucy walker (Ward Councillor)
Decision	REFUSED (unanimously) for the reasons set out in the officer's report and with the following additional reason for refusal: The detailed design is unacceptable because the excessive fenestration on the north side, the over-large dormers, the absence of chimneys, and other contemporary features such as Juliet balconies, and integral, part-glazed, garage doors do not successfully reflect the Victorian / Edwardian idiom upon which the overall mass, form and design appear to draw. Consequently, the proposed houses lack the vitality and interest of older houses in the area and their appearance fails to respond positively to the local character. For these reasons the proposal would not have a positive impact on its setting, would not preserve or enhance the character and appearance of the conservation area, and would not create an attractive, high-quality living environment. It therefore constitutes inappropriate, poor design, which has not responded positively to its context, and which fails to take the opportunities available for improving the character and quality of the area, and is therefore contrary to policies ENV6 and ENV7 of the East of England Plan (2008), policies 3/4, 3/7, 3/12 and 4/11 of the Cambridge Local Plan (2006), and government guidance in Planning Policy Statement 1: Delivering Sustainable Development (2005).

4c 09/0843/FUL: Sainsbury's Store, Brooks Road, Cambridge

4c	09/0843/FUL
Site	Sainsburys Store Brooks Road Cambridge CB1 3HP
Proposal	Extension to existing Sainsbury's Store (2709 sq m) to include extension to store frontage, provision of a mezzanine level, new entrance lobby, new associated access and improvements to the parking arrangements.
Applicant	Sainsburys Supermarket Ltd, C/O Indigo Planning Swan Court Worple Road, London SW19 4JS
Recommendation	REFUSE
Public Speakers	Sean McGrath (on behalf of applicant)
Reasons for approval raised in debate	Some Members considered that the provision in PPS4 outweighed Local Planning Policy 6/8 and 3/1.

The Chair proposed that Members move to vote against the recommendation set out in the officer's report and this was carried by 6 votes to 1.

Councillor Blencowe then moved an alternative recommendation to approve the application for the reasons set out below.

Decision **APPROVED (by 6 votes to 1)** against officer recommendation for the following reasons:

Summary reasons for approval: The Planning Committee having considered and discussed the application and having heard the arguments of the applicant and seen the advice of the Council's consultants, came to a view that inadequate weight had been given by officers to the significance of Planning Policy Statement 4 (December 2009) and its greater relevance to the proposal than Cambridge Local Plan 2006 policy 6/8 and policy 3/1. The proposal was considered to be in accordance with the guidance of Planning Policy Statement 4 and should therefore be granted.

Delegated powers given to officers to agree appropriate standard conditions, including conditions covering renewable energy, design and planting of trees and also agree and complete and S106 to cover the heads of terms we would normally require to be completed by 30 April 2010.

4d 09/1152/EXP: Motor Ace Car Sales, 87 East Road, Cambridge

4d	09/1152/EXP
Site	Motor Ace Car Sales 87 East Road Cambridge CB1 1BX
Proposal	Extension of time for implementation of C/04/0440/FP (erection of 3 one-bedroom flats and 7 two-bedroom flats over ground floor restaurant).
Applicant	Mr Robert Corcoran 87 East Road Cambridge CB1 1BX
Recommendation	REFUSE
Public Speakers	Tom Stark (on behalf of the applicant)
Decision	REFUSED (By 6 votes to 0) as agenda but with the following additional resolution:

In the event that an appeal is lodged against the decision to refuse this application, DELEGATED AUTHORITY is given to Officers to complete a section 106 agreement on behalf of the Local Planning Authority, in accordance with the requirements of the Planning Obligation Strategy 2004.

5 General Items

5a Cambridge Station Redevelopment (CB1) - Section 106 Agreement Update

Site	Cambridge Station Redevelopment (CB1)
Proposal	Section 106 Agreement Update
Recommendation	<p>2.1 That the Section 106 Agreement be completed in accordance with the draft Section 106 Agreement subject to such minor amendments as may be agreed by officers in consultation with the Chair and Spokes.</p> <p>2.2 That the draft planning conditions be amended as attached at Appendix B of the officer's report.</p> <p>2.3 That following the completion of the Section 106 Agreement Outline Planning Permission is granted subject to Planning conditions set out in Appendix B of the officer's report.</p>
Public Speakers	Mike Derbyshire (Applicant Agent) Lucy walker (Ward Councillor)
Decision	The three recommendations were voted on separately:

Recommendation 2.1

This was varied before a vote was taken to read:

That the section 106 Agreement be completed in accordance with the draft Section 106 Agreement subject to such minor amendments as may be agreed by officers in consultation with the Chair and Spokes, with the exception of non-material planning considerations and legal drafting.

APPROVED (by 6 votes to 1)

Recommendation 2.2

The draft planning conditions were amended (as attached at Appendix B of the officer's report) as follows:

Amended condition 20

The approved renewable energy technologies to meet 15% of that phase (approved in accordance with condition 6) of the development's carbon emissions shall be fully installed and operational prior to the occupation of any approved buildings and shall thereafter be maintained and remain fully operational in accordance with the approved maintenance programme.

Reason: In the interests of reducing carbon dioxide emissions (Cambridge Local Plan 2006 policy 8/16 and Supplementary Planning Document 'Sustainable Design & Construction' 2007).

APPROVED (by 7 votes to 1)

Recommendation 2.3

APPROVED (by 6 votes to 1)

5b Pre-Application Presentations by Developers

5b	Pre-Application discussions with developers, including presentations to Member's
Recommendation	To agree the protocol set out in Appendix 1 of the officer's report and to make it publicly available.
Decision	APPROVED (unanimously)

5c Objection to TPO: 10/014/T 2 : 34 Panton Street

5c	OBJECTION TO TREE WORKS APPLICATION 10/014/T 2
Site	34 Panton Street, Cambridge
Proposal	Phased reduction and removal of the weeping willow tree.
Applicant	Pembroke College, Cambridge
Recommendation	The Council raises no objection to the phased reduction and removal of the weeping willow tree.
	The tree is not made the subject of a Tree Preservation Order
Public Speakers	None
Decision	APPROVED (unanimously)

5d Tree Works Application: 10/035/T1 179 Sturton Street

5d	TREE WORKS APPLICATION 10/035/T1
Site	Hanley House, 179 Sturton Street, Cambridge
Proposal	To fell an Irish Yew Tree
Applicant	Developer/owner of Hanley House, 179 Sturton Street
Recommendation	Grant permission to fell the tree, subject to conditions
Public Speakers	None
Decision	APPROVED (unanimously)

5e Tree Works Application: 09/398/T1 Dalegarth, Milton Road

5e	TREE WORKS APPLICATION 09/398/T1
Site	Dalegarth, Milton Road, Cambridge
Proposal	To fell two Hornbeam Trees
Applicant	OCA UK Ltd on behalf of Dalegarth Residents' Association
Recommendation	Refuse permission to fell the trees.
Public Speakers	Mrs Sara Weigall (Dalegarth Residents Company Ltd in support of the felling)
Decision	REFUSED (unanimously)

5f Objection to TPO: NO. 8/2009: 1 Millington Road

5f	TREE PRESERVATION ORDER NO. 8/2009
Site	1 Millington Road, Cambridge
Proposal	Objection to TPO Objection by the owner of property
Recommendation	The Council confirm City of Cambridge (1 Millington Road) Tree Preservation Order 8/2009
Public Speakers	RG Gardiner (objection to the TPO)
Reasons for approval raised in debate	Some Members considered that the tree was too large and having an adverse affect on the growth of other trees in the vicinity.
Decision	(Against officer recommendation) NOT TO CONFIRM the TPO (by 7 votes to 1)

Due to the potential size and proximity to the house, and its affect on other tree species. It had also not been included in the original TPO for the area.

The meeting ended at 14.40pm

CHAIR