

**MINUTES OF COUNCIL MEETING**6 December 2007  
6.00pm – 11.23pm

**Present:** The Mayor (Councillor Bailey), Councillors Armstrong, Baker, Benstead, Blackhurst, Blair, Blencowe, Boyce, Bradnack, Dixon, Dryden, Durrant, Hart, Herbert, Holland, Holness, James, Kightley, Levy, McPherson, Nimmo-Smith, Pitt, Reid, Rosenstiel C, Rosenstiel J, Sadiq, Shah, Slatter, Smart, Smith, Stuart, Taylor, Upstone, Walker and Ward.

**For the Information of the Council****07/60 MINUTES**

The minutes of the Meeting held on 13 September were amended as follows:  
On page 10, fourth paragraph: "Nb. The Mayor proposed and Council agreed to adjourn the debate and move on to consider the motion minuted at number 07/56 so that Councillor Nimmo-Smith could draft a further amendment."

They were then approved as a correct record and signed by the Mayor.

**07/61 MAYOR'S ANNOUNCEMENTS****1. APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE**

Apologies for absence were received from Councillors Cantrill, Downham, Ellis-Miller, Lynn, Newbold, Sanders and Zmura.

**2. VISIT TO HEIDELBERG**

Since the last Council Meeting, the Mayor and her partner, together with the Director of Customer and Democratic Services, had visited the City's twin City of Heidelberg. They met the new Oberbürgermeister – Herr Eckardt Würzner – who expressed the wish to continue to build on the link of friendship that exists between the two cities, particularly by promoting more Member/officer project working.

**3. CAMBRIDGE-SZEGED WEEK**

Members of the Cambridge-Szeged Society promoted a Cambridge-Szeged week which took place in Cambridge in November. A number of local shops participated by displaying Hungarian merchandise and a lecture and recital also were held.

**4. PROMOTING LOCAL DEMOCRACY**

The City Council has built on its activities to mark Local Democracy Week. Councillor Neale Upstone was the winner of the Political Speed Dating event that took place at Long Road Sixth Form College on 16<sup>th</sup> October. Councillor Miriam Lynn won I'm A Councillor Get Me Out Of Here. The staff of the Children's and Young People's Services were congratulated on organising some young people to take over BBC Radio Cambridgeshire for the day on 28<sup>th</sup> October and the Mayor was escorted on her duties by two shadow Mayors on 23<sup>rd</sup> November as part of Eleven Million Take Over Day. A really excellent series of initiatives to involve young people in local democracy. As Councillor Lynn was ill and unable to receive her certificate for winning I'm a Councillor, the Mayor said she hoped to be able to present the certificate at the February meeting of Council.

Councillor Upstone received his certificate for winning the Political Speed Dating immediately following the event at Long Road Sixth Form College. The Council expressed its appreciation of his taking part and for being the Long Road students' favourite councillor.

#### **5. CHARITY QUIZ NIGHT**

The annual quiz night for employees of the Council took place on 28<sup>th</sup> November, and £1,086 was raised for the Mayor's two chosen charities. She thanked Robert Osbourn and Geoff Olliffe for once again organising this fun evening.

#### **6. THE CHEVYN SERVICE**

The preaching of the Chevyn Sermon will take place on Sunday, 27<sup>th</sup> January, 2008.

#### **7. FUND RAISING EVENT IN AID OF THE MUSEUM OF TECHNOLOGY – Wednesday, 20<sup>th</sup> February, 2008**

The Mayor gave advance notice of the date of an event being held in the Guildhall in aid of one of her chosen charities – the Museum of Technology. She asked members to note Wednesday, 20<sup>th</sup> February and to lend their support.

#### **8. Royal Anglian Regiment**

The Mayor said that Members would be aware that the Royal Anglian Regiment had been granted the Honorary Freedom of the City in 1979. In view of the close ties that exist between the City and the Regiment, and to mark their recent return from active service in Afghanistan - where, very regrettably, they lost nine men - it had been agreed that the Regiment's Band - The Minden Band - would give a concert in the Guildhall on **Wednesday, 5th March, 2008 at 7.30 p.m.** in aid of the Afghanistan Memorial Fund. This fund honours those who were killed or injured in this conflict, and offers support to families.

The Regiment has been offered the free use of the Guildhall, the Council's Box Office facility, together with administrative support and it is hoped a worthy sum of money will be raised for this cause.

#### **9. PRESENTATION OF RESOLUTION OF THANKS TO COUNCILLOR & MRS DRYDEN**

The Mayor presented to Councillor Dryden and Mrs Sandra Dryden a framed copy of the Council's resolution of thanks for their year of Mayoralty.

#### **10 DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

Councillors declared the following personal interests:

Councillor Ward in minute numbers 07/62 and 07/63 as a regular user of Cambridge Airport

Councillor C Rosenstiel in minute number 07/66 (HMB Elections) as he is a member of the Electoral Reform Society, and a trading arm of the Society is contracted to provide electoral services for the elections.

Councillors C Rosenstiel and J Rosenstiel in minute number 07/67 as members of the Campaign for Real Ale

Councillor James in minute number 07/71 as his brother is an accountant with a Housing Association.

Councillors declared the following personal and prejudicial interests. The councillors left the chamber, took no part in the debate and did not vote.

Councillors Blencowe, Durrant, Hart, Herbert, Smart, Walker in minute number 07/73 as members of the East Area Committee which would determine the planning application.

Councillor Taylor in minute number 07/67 as several members of her family were employed at the Cambridge Leisure Park.

### **07/62 PETITION**

A petition had been received containing over 500 signatures stating the following:

“We object to the damage to our open spaces that will be caused by the proposed development on Marshall’s airport, and demand that the City and County Councils:

- a) Rule out new transport or guided bus routes over Stourbridge and Coldhams Commons and Ditton Meadows, or that threaten our verges & trees.
- b) Sort out existing congestion on Newmarket Road, Coldhams Lane, Brooks Rd, East R, Mill Rd and Perne Rd now.
- c) Abandon proposals to build homes on Marshall’s airport until
  - alternative sites have been examined
  - an independent transport assessment has been carried out
  - a proper transport strategy exists for East Cambridge
- d) Consult all local residents before any decisions are taken.”

Mark Ashton, Phil Anderson and Frank Gawthrop spoke to the petition. They made the following points:

They emphasised:

- that once a Common is lost it is lost forever.
- that the Council had rejected proposals that would have spoiled Donkey’s Common. This was an opportunity for similar action.
- concerns that the current traffic congestion in Mill Road and Coldham’s Lane and the Romsey Town rat runs would be exacerbated by the large increase in residents in Cambridge East.
- that the traffic modelling studies were untrustworthy.

Councillor Bradnack also supported the petition and he tabled a statement from the Cambridge Preservation Society which had been submitted after the petition was received by the Council.

The statement said that the Society supported some aspects of the petition in relation to the proposed usage of the City’s green spaces and wildlife sites for fast linear transport routes for cyclists, standard city buses as well as the guided bus. They had strong concerns in relation to Coldhams and Stourbridge Commons. Their view was that quiet and tranquil green spaces in Cambridge were few and needed to be protected and enhanced for enjoyment by local people and to benefit wildlife. Stronger commitment to protect and enhance our public green spaces

was essential at this time of major change of the City's environs.

### **07/63 PUBLIC QUESTION TIME**

No members of the public wanted to ask a question.

Under paragraph 4.2.1 of the Council Procedure Rules, the Mayor used her discretion to alter the order of business to take the motion on Cambridge East (minute number 07/64) next.

### **07/64**

#### **CAMBRIDGE EAST**

Councillor Durrant proposed and Councillor Bradnack seconded the following motion:

"Following the referral of the motion on Congestion Charging at Council on 13 September 2007 to the Special Meeting of the Environment Scrutiny Committee on 25 September 2007 and, in the light of the resolution agreed at that meeting which, in summary, seeks to secure a sound and robust basis for the planned growth of the city,

1. This Council recognises the concerns expressed in the petition received by the Council today in the following terms:

"We object to the damage to our open spaces that will be caused by the proposed development on Marshall's airport, and demand that the City and County Councils:

- a) Rule out new transport or guided bus routes over Stourbridge and Coldhams Commons and Ditton Meadows, or that threaten our verges & trees.
- b) Sort out existing congestion on Newmarket Road, Coldhams Lane, Brooks Rd, East R, Mill Rd and Perne Rd now.
- c) Abandon proposals to build homes on Marshall's airport until
  - alternative sites have been examined
  - an independent transport assessment has been carried out
  - a proper transport strategy exists for East Cambridge
- d) Consult all local residents before any decisions are taken."

2. This Council calls upon the Director of Environment & Planning to submit a report to the next meeting of the Environment Scrutiny Committee setting out how the concerns of the petitioners may be addressed, including the scope for review of local plan policies."

Under paragraph 13.8 of the Council Procedure Rules it was agreed to deal with the motion at the meeting.

Councillor Reid, seconded by Councillor Ward proposed the following amendment:

"The City Council welcomes the government inspector's report endorsing the Area Action Plan for Cambridge East, the product of extensive public consultation and government inspection.

The Council also welcomes the recent analysis of public open space in the Cambridge fringes, demonstrating that while the built up areas increase the city by some 12% (from 4070ha to 4575ha) the available public open space will be doubled (from 265ha to 580ha).

The Council also notes the huge backlog of unmet housing need in the city, which means many outside the city and travel in to work. The Council welcomes the prospect of houses being available in Cambridge East, both to buy and for social let, to meet this great need.

The City Council reminds the County Council of the following motions: 06/77 of December 2006, 07/08 of February 2007, and 07/41 of May 2007. They set out its position on transport planning and on transport in relation to green spaces.

In particular the City Council reaffirms its continued opposition to the suggested route for a transport link across Coldhams Common next to Coldhams Brook. It is keen that the tunnel option be explored and it may consider a public transport only route next to the railway-line if the vehicle was silent, low, environmentally friendly and convenient for the new citizens of Cambridge East.”

The amendment was carried by 21 votes to 11.

Councillor Bradnack, seconded by Councillor Durrant proposed the following amendment to the amended motion:

“Retain all and add point 2 from the original motion:

2. This Council calls upon the Director of Environment & Planning to submit a report to the next meeting of the Environment Scrutiny Committee setting out how the concerns of the petitioners may be addressed, including the scope for review of local plan policies.”

The amendment was lost by 22 votes to 10.

**Resolved** (by 22 votes to 10) That the City Council welcomes the government inspector’s report endorsing the Area Action Plan for Cambridge East, the product of extensive public consultation and government inspection.

The Council also welcomes the recent analysis of public open space in the Cambridge fringes, demonstrating that while the built up areas increase the city by some 12% (from 4070ha to 4575ha) the available public open space will be doubled (from 265ha to 580ha).

The Council also notes the huge backlog of unmet housing need in the city, which means many outside the city and travel in to work. The Council welcomes the prospect of houses being available in Cambridge East, both to buy and for social let, to meet this great need.

The City Council reminds the County Council of the following motions: 06/77 of December 2006, 07/08 of February 2007, and 07/41 of May 2007. They set out its position on transport planning and on transport in relation to green spaces.

In particular the City Council reaffirms its continued opposition to the suggested route for a transport link across Coldhams Common next to Coldhams Brook. It is keen that the tunnel option be explored and it may consider a public transport only route next to the railway-line if the vehicle was silent, low, environmentally friendly and convenient for the new citizens of Cambridge East.

## **07/65 TO CONSIDER THE RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE EXECUTIVE FOR ADOPTION**

### **A. The Council’s Budget (The Leader)**

**Resolved** (by 22 votes to 0)

**Revenue:**

- a) To approve the recommendation from the Executive Councillor for Housing – to re-phase £25,000 of revenue resources from 2007/08 into 2008/09, in respect of the post implementation work associated with the Choice Based Lettings Scheme.
- b) Including the recommendation a), to approve the current year funding requests of £439,510 and savings of £811,980 (shown in Appendix B ) and the revised revenue budgets for 2007/08 (shown in Appendix A), which will result in a net reduction in the use of General Fund reserves of £372,470 in 2007/08.

**Capital:**

- c) To approve the recommendation from the Executive Councillor for Housing – to approve the revised Housing Investment Plan for 2007/08 and 2008/09 (shown in Appendix E and the associated notes).

**B. The Sustainable Community Strategy (The Leader)**

**Resolved** (by 32 votes to 0) to adopt the Sustainable Community Strategy 2008-2010.

**07/66 TO CONSIDER THE RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE CIVIC AFFAIRS COMMITTEE FOR ADOPTION**

**07/CIV/46 Members Allowances 2008-2009**

Councillor Boyce as Chair of Civic Affairs said that Lib Dem members did not accept the report from the Independent Panel. He proposed that the recommendations to Council be deleted and that the report of the Independent Panel be referred back to the Panel for further consideration. He requested that a further report be submitted to Civic Affairs and the outcome be reported to Council in April. Councillor C Rosenstiel seconded this.

Councillor Dryden asked if reasons could be given as to why this action was being taken. Councillor Boyce said doubts about the evidence had been expressed by 6 of those who had kept diaries for 6 months.

The amendment was passed by 25 votes to 0.

**Resolved** (by 23 votes to 0) to delete the recommendations to Council and to refer the report of the Independent Panel back to the Panel for further consideration after which a further report to be submitted to Civic Affairs before recommendations to the April meeting of Council.

**07/CIV/47 Constitutional Changes – HMB Elections**

**Resolved** (by 33 votes to 0) to agree the changes to the HMB Constitution as set out in the appendix.

**07/CIV/47 Responsibility for Guildhall Hall Lettings**

**Resolved** (by 33 votes to 0) to amend the Constitution to reflect Executive responsibility for the Guildhall Halls sit with the Executive Councillor for Arts & Recreation.

**07/67 TO CONSIDER THE RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE LICENSING COMMITTEE FOR ADOPTION**

Councillor Dixon, as Chair of the Licensing Committee, stated that the wording of the Revised Statement of Licensing Policy at paragraphs 5.4 and 5.5 did not reflect what was recommended by the Committee, which had preferred the word “detrimental” to the word “negative”. With the agreement of the Council the wording of the recommended Statement was corrected accordingly.

07/Licensing/08

### **Revised Statement of Licensing Policy**

**Resolved** (by 30 votes to 0) to adopt the Revised Statement of Licensing Policy as corrected.

### **07/68 ORAL QUESTIONS**

1. From Cllr Herbert to Cllr Smith

What action does she plan to take to prevent a further year when hundreds of 'Cambridge resident only' folk festival tickets are sold on Ebay and elsewhere and then used by non-residents without any checks?

2. From Cllr Blencowe to Cllr Cantrill

Whilst commending the recent facelift given to Fisher Square including a new sculpture it is noted that the owners of Lion Yard now have planning permission (gained on appeal following refusal at planning committee) to close off the long standing access/egress from Lion Yard into Fisher Square.

Does the Executive Councillor agree or disagree with this closure? And could he give some explanation as to why.

3. From Cllr Dryden to Cllr Smart

As a result of the housing stock survey on communal TV aerials it would seem that many tenants and leaseholders will now be required to supply their own TV reception devices (as opposed to being on a communal system).

Is the likely increase in the number of aerials and dishes appearing on our council estates and housing areas acceptable in both environmental and aesthetic terms?

4. From Cllr Sadiq to Cllr Smart

Given the shortage of affordable housing for older people what plans does the Executive Councillor for Housing have for the provision of affordable and sheltered housing on the Tiverton House site?

5. From Cllr Herbert to Cllr Nimmo Smith

Given his recent media coverage on protecting historic buildings, what specific measures has he initiated recently to advance their conservation using the City Council's wide ranging powers?

### **07/69 MOTION: Designated Public Places Order**

Councillor Bradnack proposed and Councillor Blencowe seconded the following motion:

“This Council accepts the view of the Cambridge Community Safety Partnership Strategic Assessment for the Southern Division Area in its October 2007 report that 'a Designated

Public Places Order should be considered for implementation in areas that suffer a large proportion of alcohol related anti-social behaviour.”

Under paragraph 13.8 of the Council Procedure Rules it was agreed to deal with the motion at the meeting.

The motion was lost by 22 votes to 10.

### **07/70 MOTION: SEASONAL PLANTING**

Councillor Dryden proposed and Councillor Herbert seconded the following motion:

“The Council supports

1) the retention of the following seasonal planting recently proposed for low maintenance permanent planting from 2008

- Christ's Pieces - 3 beds
- Hills Road War Memorial
- Hobson's Conduit
- Jesus Green - 2 beds
- Highworth Avenue small island
- Crematorium Entrance
- Alexandra Gardens
- Honey Hill
- Queen Ediths / Fendon Road Island
- Coleridge Recreation Ground Entrance
- Cherry Hinton Hall Parterre Garden
- Market Square Fountain, and
- Lion Yard Roof Garden

and the continuance of all other plant displays provided by the Council in 2007

2) further investigation into the council growing seasonal bedding plants in the city

3) ensuring that any tender criteria for bedding plant purchase include a high weighting for minimising 'plant miles'

4) investigation into the potential for additional seasonal bedding sites in the city from 2008 where they can be provided at nil-net cost to Council tax payers via non-obtrusive sponsorship,

and calls on the Executive Councillor for Arts and Recreation to bring forward detailed, costed proposals for the above to be considered as items for the 2008/9 Council budget.”

Under paragraph 13.8 of the Council Procedure Rules it was agreed to deal with the motion at the meeting.

Councillor Smith proposed and Councillor Slatter seconded the following amendment:

Delete all and replace with:

"The Council notes the decision to close the propagation centre, which was taken for sound financial and environmental reasons. It acknowledges that it is not usually financially viable for an authority the size of Cambridge City to grow its own plants. It welcomes the criteria for

sourcing plants in future, which include 'plant miles' and is delighted that future planting will continue to maintain the standards of excellence that Cambridge residents and visitors to our City have come to expect."

The amendment was carried by 20 votes to 10.

**Resolved** (by 19 votes to 10): That the Council notes the decision to close the propagation centre, which was taken for sound financial and environmental reasons. It acknowledges that it is not usually financially viable for an authority the size of Cambridge City to grow its own plants. It welcomes the criteria for sourcing plants in future, which include 'plant miles' and is delighted that future planting will continue to maintain the standards of excellence that Cambridge residents and visitors to our City have come to expect.

### **07/71 MOTION: CO-OPERATIVE HOUSING**

Councillor Slatter proposed and Councillor Blencowe seconded the following motion:

"This council undertakes to promote co-operative housing in the new developments as part of its overall affordable housing commitment and will seek to work with partners to secure a site where the co-operative housing can be retained permanently."

Under paragraph 13.8 of the Council Procedure Rules it was agreed to deal with the motion at the meeting.

**Resolved** (unanimously): That this council undertakes to promote co-operative housing in the new developments as part of its overall affordable housing commitment and will seek to work with partners to secure a site where the co-operative housing can be retained permanently.

### **07/72 DURATION OF MEETING**

**Resolved**: unanimously at 10.30pm under Council Procedure Rule 10.1 that the meeting not be adjourned.

Under paragraph 4.2.1 of the Council Procedure Rules, the Mayor used her discretion to alter the order of business to take the motion on Inter-Authority Joint Bodies (minute number 07/73) next.

### **07/73 MOTION: INTER-AUTHORITY JOINT BODIES**

With the consent of Council, Councillor Nimmo-Smith altered the wording of the motion.

Councillor Nimmo-Smith proposed and Councillor Smart seconded the following motion:

"The Council notes the growing number of inter-authority joint bodies in which it is required to participate.

In order to maintain the standards of accessibility and accountability to which it aspires, the Council will strive to get agreement that these joint bodies will operate according to minimum democratic standards including the publication of agendas, minutes and reports, meetings held in public, public speaking rights and public question times."

Under paragraph 13.8 of the Council Procedure Rules it was agreed to deal with the

motion at the meeting.

**Resolved** (unanimously): That the Council notes the growing number of inter-authority joint bodies in which it is required to participate.

In order to maintain the standards of accessibility and accountability to which it aspires, the Council will strive to get agreement that these joint bodies will operate according to minimum democratic standards including the publication of agendas, minutes and reports, meetings held in public, public speaking rights and public question times.

#### **07/74 MOTION: TESCO'S AND MILL ROAD**

With the consent of Council, Councillor Nimmo-Smith altered the wording of the motion.

Councillor Nimmo-Smith proposed and Councillor Shah seconded the following motion:

The Council recognises the level of public concern relating to Tesco plc's proposal to open a large convenience store on Mill Road Broadway.

This occurs in a context where the Competition Commission has recently identified that Tesco commands a 51% share of the grocery retail business in Cambridge.

The Council notes evidence given to the House of Commons All Party Small Shops Group which documents the way in which the arrival of large new convenience stores can cause existing retail businesses to become non-viable.

By contrast it also notes that the arrival of convenience stores such as Tesco Express in Campkin Road and Chesterton High Street has had a beneficial effect.

The Council welcomes the Corporate Responsibility provisions of the Companies Act 2006 which requires publicly listed companies to report on a range of issues including social and community issues where they are necessary to understanding the company's business.

However the Council regrets that in passing this Act the Government sided with some big business interest groups who lobbied against widening the application of the reporting requirements to a much larger number of companies and against legal standards on how they should report on these issues.

Despite this the Council calls on Tesco plc to recognise and respond to these issues of corporate responsibility when it has such a dominant market position in Cambridge by reconsidering its current plans.

The Council recognises that forthcoming decisions relating to associated planning applications will be made by councillors solely in accordance with national and local planning policies and in the light of material considerations."

Under paragraph 13.8 of the Council Procedure Rules it was agreed to deal with the motion at the meeting.

Councillor Bradnack proposed and Councillor Sadiq seconded the following amendment:

"Delete all except:

The Council recognises the level of public concern relating to Tesco plc's proposal to open a large convenience store on Mill Road Broadway.

This occurs in a context where the Competition Commission has recently identified that Tesco commands a 51% share of the grocery retail business in Cambridge.

The Council recognises that forthcoming decisions relating to associated planning applications will be made by councillors solely in accordance with national and local planning policies and in the light of material considerations.”

The amendment was lost by 19 votes to 3.

**Resolved** (by 19 votes to 0): That the Council recognises the level of public concern relating to Tesco plc's proposal to open a large convenience store on Mill Road Broadway.

This occurs in a context where the Competition Commission has recently identified that Tesco commands a 51% share of the grocery retail business in Cambridge.

The Council notes evidence given to the House of Commons All Party Small Shops Group which documents the way in which the arrival of large new convenience stores can cause existing retail businesses to become non-viable.

By contrast it also notes that the arrival of convenience stores such as Tesco Express in Campkin Road and Chesterton High Street has had a beneficial effect.

The Council welcomes the Corporate Responsibility provisions of the Companies Act 2006 which requires publicly listed companies to report on a range of issues including social and community issues where they are necessary to understanding the company's business.

However the Council regrets that in passing this Act the Government sided with some big business interest groups who lobbied against widening the application of the reporting requirements to a much larger number of companies and against legal standards on how they should report on these issues.

Despite this the Council calls on Tesco plc to recognise and respond to these issues of corporate responsibility when it has such a dominant market position in Cambridge by reconsidering its current plans.

The Council recognises that forthcoming decisions relating to associated planning applications will be made by councillors solely in accordance with national and local planning policies and in the light of material considerations.”

#### **07/75 RECORDS OF DECISIONS MADE BY MEMBERS OF THE EXECUTIVE**

The Council received the records of decisions made by Executive Councillors as set out in the agenda.

#### **07/76 TO RECEIVE THE MINUTES OF COMMITTEES FOR INFORMATION**

Members received the minutes from committees as laid around the Chamber.

The Council concluded its business at 11.23pm

**MAYOR**